Comparative Studies in the History of Insurance Law

Studien zur vergleichenden Geschichte des Versicherungsrechts

Volume / Band 2

The Past, Present, and Future of Tontines

A Seventeenth Century Financial Product and the Development of Life Insurance

Edited by

Phillip Hellwege

Duncker & Humblot · Berlin
PHILLIP HELLWEGE (ED.)

The Past, Present, and Future of Tontines
Comparative Studies
in the History of Insurance Law

Studien zur vergleichenden Geschichte
des Versicherungsrechts

Edited by/ Herausgegeben von
Prof. Dr. Phillip Hellwege

Volume/Band 2
The Past, Present, and Future of Tontines

A Seventeenth Century Financial Product and the Development of Life Insurance

Edited by

Phillip Hellwege

Duncker & Humblot · Berlin
The project ‘A Comparative History of Insurance Law in Europe’ has received funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement No. 647019).

Bibliographic information of the German national library

The German national library registers this publication in the German national bibliography; specified bibliographic data are retrievable on the Internet about http://dnb.d-nb.de.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, translated, or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, without the expressed written consent of the publisher.

© 2018 Duncker & Humblot GmbH, Berlin

Printing: CPI buchbücher.de GmbH, Birkach

Printed in Germany

ISSN 2625-638X (Print) / ISSN 2625-6398 (Online)

ISBN 978-3-428-15615-3 (Print)
ISBN 978-3-428-85615-2 (Print & E-Book)

Printed on no aging resistant (non-acid) paper according to ISO 9706 😊
Preface

The present volume is the second volume in the research project: ‘A Comparative History of Insurance Law in Europe’ (CHILE). CHILE has received funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement No. 647019). The deadline for submitting the final papers was 31 May 2017. I would like to thank Michael Friedman for his critical comments on an earlier draft of this volume and for correcting the English.

Augsburg, July 2018

Phillip Hellwege
Summary of Contents

Phillip Hellwege
Chapter 1: Introduction........................................................................................................ 9

Part 1
The Framework for the Development of Tontines

Christian Rietsch and Georges Gallais-Hamonno
Chapter 2: Lorenzo Tonti........................................................................................................ 19

Georges Gallais-Hamonno and Christian Rietsch
Chapter 3: Financial Engineering in the 17th and 18th Centuries – Tontines in England, France, and Ireland ........................................................................................................ 49

Robin Pearson
Chapter 4: The Socio-Economic Setting for Developing Tontines from the 17th to the 19th Centuries ........................................................................................................ 79

Part 2
A Comparative Legal History of Tontines

Sophie Delbrel
Chapter 5: Tontines in France from the Ancien Régime to the Third Republic ..... 109

Boudewijn Sirks
Chapter 6: Tontines in the Dutch Republic and the Early Kingdom (1670–1869) . 121

John MacLeod
Chapter 7: Tontines in England and Scotland................................................................. 143

Martin Sunnqvist
Chapter 8: Tontines in Scandinavia................................................................................. 153

Phillip Hellwege
Chapter 9: Tontines in German-Speaking Territories................................................. 167

Kent McKeever
Chapter 10: Tontines in Portugal – Nicholas Bourey’s Paleo-Tontine of 1641 ..... 193

Maura Fortunati
Chapter 11: Tontines in Italy ......................................................................................... 203

Rafael Illescas
Chapter 12: Tontines in Spain ....................................................................................... 229
Summary of Contents

**Kent McKeever**
Chapter 13: The Evolution of the Tontine in North America ........................................ 239

**Marcelo Nasser**
Chapter 14: Tontines in Latin America ........................................................................... 259

**Jan Halberda**
Chapter 15: Tontines in Poland ......................................................................................... 273

**Balázs Tőkey**
Chapter 16: Tontines in Hungary ....................................................................................... 289

**Tamara Korchagina**
Chapter 17: The Russian Experience with Tontine Insurance ...................................... 297

**Part 3**
The Present and Future of Tontines

**Moshe A. Milevsky**

**Jan-Hendrik Weinert**
Chapter 19: Tontines in Europe Today ........................................................................... 317

**Jonathan Barry Forman and Michael J. Sabin**
Chapter 20: Tontines in the Western World Today ....................................................... 329

**Salvatore Mancuso**
Chapter 21: Tontines and other Forms of Rotating Credit Associations in Africa .... 343

**Part 4**
Comparative Analyses

**Jerònia Pons Pons**
Chapter 22: A Comparative Analysis from the Perspective of Economic History .... 367

**Phillip Hellwege**
Chapter 23: A Comparative Analysis from the Perspective of Legal History ........... 383

List of Contributors .................................................................................................. 399

Index ......................................................................................................................... 401
Chapter 1: Introduction

By Phillip Hellwege

A. A modern definition of tontines

A tontine may be described as a pooled life annuity. Investors buy a pre-defined number of shares, paying the same purchase price for each share. The issuer in turn promises to pay interest each year on the total amount of raised capital – that is, the total sum of the purchase prices – as annuities to the investors. The characteristic feature of tontines is that the annuities of deceased investors are shared by surviving investors. The investors’ heirs have no rights in the tontine. Thus, the total sum of annuities is, each year, divided between the surviving investors. The more investors that die, the higher the share of each surviving investor is, until the last surviving investor receives the total amount of annuities. With the death of the last survivor, the issuer’s obligation to pay annuities terminates. Furthermore, the issuer has no obligation to repay the raised capital back to the investors: the capital is lost to the issuer.

To give a simple example: an issuer offers 100 shares, each at a cost of 100 Euro and promises to pay 5% interest per annum. The raised capital is 10,000 Euro. The annuities thus amount to 500 Euro per annum. As long as all 100 investors are alive, each of them will each year receive 5 Euro as annuity. When 50 investors have died, the 50 survivors will share the total annuities amount of 500 Euro: each surviving investor will receive 10 Euro as his or her annuity. When there are only 10 investors left, each will receive 50 Euro per annum. The last surviving investor will receive 500 Euro per annum – based on his or her original investment of 100 Euro.

A tontine can serve different functions. Investors can use it as a pension product: the longer an investor lives, the higher his or her chances are of outliving

---

1 In detail see Gallais-Hamonno and Rietsch, 50, below.
the other investors and, correspondingly, the higher his or her chances are of receiving an increase in annuities. A tontine may also be used as a means to provide for close relatives: the investor and the annuitant do not need to be identical. The issuer, for his part, may use a tontine as a tool to raise capital: once the last annuitant dies, the obligation to pay interest on the capital terminates and he has no obligation to repay the capital to the investors.

B. The practical importance of tontines

It is generally believed that the Italian Lorenzo Tonti (1602–1684) invented tontines and that he proposed them to Cardinal Mazarin (1602–1661) in 1653. However, Tonti’s original plan of 1653 failed to be implemented. A Danish plan of the same year similarly failed to be implemented. It is generally thought that the first tontines in Europe were successfully launched in Holland: 1670 in Kampen and 1671 in Amsterdam and Groningen, with more to follow. France issued its first tontine in 1689, with England coming soon after in 1692. The first German tontine is said to have been issued in 1698. It is thought that tontines witnessed their apex in the 18th century. Nevertheless, the number of tontines mentioned in modern literature is small: it discusses a handful of tontines in France, England, Ireland, and Denmark. For Germany, modern literature usually refers to tontines in Bolzano (1737), Gotha (1752), Austria (1760), Nuremberg (1777 and 1783), Potsdam (1788), and a small number of tontines in Hamburg. It is only the Dutch literature that has identified a larger number of tontines for the 17th and 18th century.

German literature asserts that tontines were replaced by modern life insurance products in the early 19th century. Yet it seems that they resurfaced in the second half of the 19th century: U.S. life insurance companies offered tontine life insurance products on the European market, and these products were controversially discussed. As a consequence of the problems which these products generated, tontines were banned in many, but not all European countries. Furthermore, by the end of the 19th century it was generally thought that tontines were a form of gambling. In some European countries, tontines have nevertheless persisted, but only as a financial niche product. With the implementation of the Second European Life Insurance Directive of 1990, life insurance companies have again been allowed to offer tontine products in all Member States of the EU. Still, it seems that they have not regained any prominence.

---

2 In detail see Gallais-Hamonno and Rietsch, 50 f., below.
3 In detail see Hellwege, 167, below.
C. Tontines and the history of life insurance

In conclusion, it seems that tontines are a purely historical phenomenon. And from an historical perspective, they seem to have been of only minor practical importance. Nevertheless, modern German-language literature stresses that tontines had a lasting impact on the development of life insurance. It is argued that ‘tontines … helped spread the idea of insurance and made wider circles receptive for the idea of life insurance’ (‘Das Tontinenwesen … hat den Versicherungsgedanken verbreitet und weite Kreise für die Lebensversicherung reif gemacht.’).

Others add that tontines were forerunners of pension schemes and that they were important in further developing mortality tables and actuarial science. With respect to legal developments Hans-Martin Oberholzer claims:

Due to the fact that tontines … were such a great success, national legislators felt impelled at an early stage to intervene with respect to their greatest defects. Thereby they laid the basis for today’s insurance law. A consequence of this insurance legislation was the creation of trustworthy insurance companies.

Or in the words of Gunter Kürble, who focuses more on the design of different insurance products rather than on their legal development:

The path towards a functioning life and pension insurance market was the patient history (anamnesis) of the tontine.

And L. Gustav Du Pasquier summarizes:

Die Tontinen haben in der Entwicklung des Versicherungswesens eine ausserordentlich wichtige Rolle gespielt.

---

5 Heinrich Braun, Urkunden und Materialien zur Geschichte der Lebensversicherung und der Lebensversicherungstechnik (1937), 100.
7 Peter Koch, Geschichte der Versicherungswissenschaft in Deutschland (1998), 34–36.